
Proposal to add Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Lane, Dublin 2 to the Record of Protected Structures in accordance with Section 54 and 55 of the Planning and Development Act, 2000.

Photo of Structure



Introduction

In accordance with the provisions under Section 55 of the Planning & Development Act it is proposed to make the addition of the **Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Lane, Dublin 2** to the Dublin City Council's Record of Protected Structures (RPS).

Request for Addition

George Boyle, Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Lane, Dublin 2

Summary of Applicants Reasons for Seeking Addition

George Boyle, a founder of Fumbally Exchange and occupant of the building, makes the following case for the inclusion of no.5 Dame Lane on the Dublin City Council Record of Protected Structures:

'This building – the former Hely's Printworks, workplace of Leopold Bloom in Ulysses, built by Samuel Beckett's grandfather and first example of Hennebique architectural construction in Dublin ... showcasing an enormous array of cultural, architectural,

engineering, technical and scientific features of significance, not to mention the cultural resonance of its role as a home of industry, fictional workplace for James Joyce's hero and currently one of the richest national centres for design and innovation in the city.'

2011-2017 Development Plan Zoning & Location Map: Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Lane, is located along the south of Dame Lane, bound to the east by a public house, no.4 Dame Lane, and to the west by a building occupied by Eircom Ltd. There is a large open car park site to the south, accessed from St Andrew's Lane.

The location of the Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Lane, Dublin 2 is shown in green. The zoning objective for the site is Z5: To consolidate and facilitate the development of the central area, and to identify, reinforce and strengthen and protect its civic design character and dignity.



Recent Planning History:

There are no recent planning permission applications pertaining to no.5 Dame Lane. There is one planning permission application for the site to rear of no.5 Dame Lane, also in ownership of Eircom Ltd (now Eir).

Planning Ref: 3057/00: permission granted for two no. single storey sub-stations.

Summary Description:

Attached three-bay four-storey office building over basement, retail unit and shopfront to ground floor, built c.1906. Triple gabled slate roofs, set parallel to street elevation, mansarded to front, with three dormer windows to front (north) elevation. Reinforced concrete structure employing the Hennebique system, rendered façade to upper floors featuring rusticated piers supporting moulded cornice with modillions. Glazed brick piers to ground floor, having rounded corners and moulded brick course. Square-headed window openings, with replacement glazing. Curved corner glazing to retail unit. Recessed stepped approach to entrance. Recent decorative signage to horizontal bands. Smooth rendered façade to rear elevation.

Exposed timber roof trusses to third floor, supported on Hennebique concrete structure. Exposed concrete structure and open plan arrangement to ground, second and third floors. Suspended ceilings and partitioned cellular rooms to first floor.

Assessment of Significance Under The national Inventory of Architectural Heritage and of Special Interest under the Planning and Development Act, 2000 (as amended):

The National Inventory of Architectural Heritage (NIAH) has not been carried out for this area; however, its categories of special interest (architectural, historical, archaeological, artistic, cultural, scientific, technical & social) and its rating system has been used to assess the structure in question. The NIAH identifies five categories of rating in seeking to rank buildings. The NIAH rating values are International, National, Regional, Local and Record Only (I, N, R, L, O). Structures which are considered of **International**, **National**, and **Regional** significance are recommended by the Minister to the relevant planning authority for inclusion in their RPS.

An assessment report and photographic record of the structure, its fixtures and features, was commissioned by the Planning & Property Development Department from Merlo Kelly, Conservation Architect, of Lotts Architecture and Urbanism, to advise the Conservation Section in respect of the assessment of significance and the special interest of this 20th century structure, respectively, as considered and integrated into its report to the meeting of the South East Area Committee on the 8th May 2017 in relation to initiating the procedure for addition to the RPS.

The consultants consider the building to be of Regional significance. These are structures or sites that make a significant contribution to the architectural heritage within their region or area.

The rationale for Regional Rating: 5 Dame Lane, formerly Hely's Printworks, is significant for its early use of the Hennebique system, or 'Ferro-Concrete', which was developed in France the late nineteenth century. Completed in 1906, it is reputedly the earliest example of the structural system in Dublin. Hely's Printworks was the former workplace of Leopold Bloom, the fictional hero in Joyce's Ulysses.

The structure is considered to be of special interest under the following headings:

Architectural:

5 Dame Lane was designed by Frederick George Hicks and Frederick Batchelor of Batchelor & Hicks, a Dublin-based architectural firm established in 1905, with their offices at 86 Merrion Square (www.dia.ie). They were responsible for the design of the Great Southern Hotel in Killarney (1906), Weirs on Grafton Street (1906) and the RIAC building on Dawson Street, among other works. Hicks' works also include the Iveagh Markets (1902) and St Thomas's Church on Cathal Brugha Street (1931).

The conservative architectural language of the façade, with its stripped classical detailing, conceals a sophisticated reinforced concrete structure within. Designed as an industrial complex, the interiors are defined by the Hennebique structural system, allowing for impressive spaces on the upper floors.

'Though designed to be utilitarian in character, it is the flexibility and adaptability of the Hennebique structure employed at No.5 Dame Lane that is its virtue and has ensured its continued use. Similarly, though the principal architectural interest lies in its neo-classical street-facing elevation, it's purely functional rear elevation addresses the interior courtyard, the former industrial inner sanctum, which itself echoes the site's medieval 'court' antecedents and partially stands on the former site of Trinity Hall, the first home of the RCSI.' (Marnham, 2015).

There is some fine detailing evident, notably the glazed brick piers to the entrance façade, the decorative detailing to the cornice and pilasters, and the steel windows to the rear.

Historical:

5 Dame Lane formed part of the larger Hely's complex. From 1906, Hely's Printworks became known as The Acme Works, Dame Court. At this time, Hely's were involved in printing playbills for productions at the Abbey Theatre, at the time of the Irish Literary Revival. They also published the report of the Great Exhibition of 1907 in Herbert Park. When World War I broke out in 1914, Hely's were responsible for printing a number of propaganda posters urging men to fight in the British Army. Alongside this, the company were engaged to document the 1916 Rising, printing postcards and booklets depicting the 'Sinn Féin Revolt'.

Cultural:

Hely's Printworks on Dame Lane / Dame Court was the former workplace of Leopold Bloom, the fictional hero in Joyce's *Ulysses* (1922), and is referenced later in the novel when Bloom encounters sandwich-board men advertising Hely's Printworks (Chapter 8 "The Lestrygonians" and Chapter 10 "Wandering Rocks").

"He read the scarlet letters on their five tall white hats: H.E.L. Y.S." (Joyce, 1922)

The building was constructed by prominent Dublin builders J&W Beckett. W Beckett was the grandfather of writer Samuel Beckett (www.dia.ie).

Technical:

5 Dame Lane is significant for its early use of the *Hennebique* system, or 'Ferro-Concrete' which was developed in France the late nineteenth century. Francois Hennebique patented his pioneering reinforced concrete system in 1892, combining separate structural members to create a singular monolithic element.

In 1897, the engineering firm LG Mouchel & Partners was licensed to use the new technique of reinforcing concrete using iron bars developed by engineer François Hennebique.

'As Hennebique's agent, Mouchel effectively established the use of reinforced concrete in Britain, particularly for framed buildings. At this time, when reinforced concrete was developed and marketed by rival patentees, Hennebique was expanding his organization rapidly.' (www.oxforddnb.com)

A definitive handbook for engineers and architects, outlining the theory and practice of 'Hennebique Ferro-Concrete' was published in 1909, written by LG Mouchel & Partners:

'The concrete is invariably made with the best qualities of genuine Portland cement, clean sharp sand, and aggregate consisting of gravel or hard stone. The steel employed is of the type generally described as mild steel, and alternatively known on the Continent as weld iron or ingot iron, in contradistinction to qualities of metal which in this country are designated high-carbon steel or hard steel.'

Ellen Rowley cites Batchelor & Hicks' work on the Hely complex as an early example of the Hennebique system (it should be noted that the address for Hely's Printworks is generally listed as Dame Street, as their headquarters were located on Dame Street):

'De Courcy has estimated that there were eighty-three Hennebique structures built in Ireland between 1905 and 1920. Aside from engineering or industrial projects, the system of interlocking posts, beams and lintels lent itself well to multi-storey urban civic architecture, and the first application of it in Dublin streets was at Hely's premises, Dame Street (Batchelor and Hicks, 1906).'

Christine Casey makes reference to the first use of the Hennebique system in Dublin in 1906, referencing the architects Batchelor & Hicks:

‘Similar ornaments to Nos.27-28, whose structure was altered on many occasions, most significantly in 1906 when Batchelor & Hicks employed the Hennebique system of reinforced concrete framing reputedly for the first time in Dublin.’

Sean Rothery highlights a number of Hennebique structures constructed in Ireland, among them the Maize Mill and Grain Silos in Sligo (1905), Monarch Laundry in Belfast (1907) and the Granary in Westport (1908). He refers to an Irish Builder article from 1906, confirming that Batchelor & Hicks’ building at Dame Street was the first use of the Hennebique system in Dublin.

Submissions/Objections Received

One (1) submission was received opposing (objecting to) the proposal to make the addition of 5 Dame Lane to the Record of Protected Structures (RPS). This submission was received from David Slattery Conservation Architects, on behalf of the building owner Eir.

Seven (7) submissions were received in support of the proposal to add 5 Dame Lane to the RPS. These submissions were received from the following:

- 1) Shane O’Toole, Architect, Adjunct Associate Professor, UCD School of Architecture Planning and Environmental Policy / Treasurer, Docomomo Ireland
- 2) Susan Roundtree, RIAI accredited Grade I Conservation Architect
- 3) Olivia Golden, Architectural Technologist
- 4) Ciaran Ferrie, Architect / Director of Fumbally Exchange
- 5) Kate Horgan, Editor / Designer / Photographer
- 6) Denis O’Kelly
- 7) Jen Kelly, Women in Trades Network Ireland

The grounds of the written submissions in support of the addition and those of the submission of objection to the addition may be grouped as follows and as summarised below:

- Architectural Significance; including detail and design.
- Historical Significance.
- Cultural Significance
- Technical Significance
- Group Significance (Context and Setting)
- Design Suitability and Use

Architectural Significance (including detail and design)

The submission from David Slattery Conservation Architects examines the architectural qualities of 5 Dame Lane under the suggested headings outlined in the Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities (Department of Environment, Heritage and Local Government, 2004; and DAHG, 2011; now the Department of Culture, Heritage and the Gaeltacht, 2011):

- A generally agreed exemplar of good quality architectural design;
- The work of a known and distinguished architect, engineer, designer or craftsman;
- An exemplar of a building type, plan-form, style or styles of any period but also the harmonious interrelationship of differing styles within one structure;
- A structure which makes a positive contribution to its setting, such as a streetscape or a group of structures in an urban area, or the landscape in a rural area;
- A structure with an interior that is well designed, rich in decoration, complex or spatially pleasing;

It is submitted by David Slattery Conservation Architects that “The subject building does not meet the DoAHG’s five criteria and is not worthy of inclusion on the RPS in respect of its architectural interest.”

The following is a consideration of the architectural qualities of 5 Dame Lane, and the various submissions under the suggested headings for as provided in the Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities (DAHG, 2011; now the Department of Culture, Heritage and the Gaeltacht):

Heading 1: A generally agreed exemplar of good quality architectural design

David Slattery Conservation Architects argue that 5 Dame Lane “offers little to the streetscape and pays little regard to its more considered brick neighbours” and describe it as “a crude extension” (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

Heading 2: The work of a known and distinguished architect, engineer, designer or craftsman

David Slattery Conservation Architects contest the significance of Batchelor and Hicks’ architectural work; “Batchelor & Hicks were responsible for a number of buildings in the city but they would not be considered as eminent architects of their time.” (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

However, Susan Roundtree acknowledges their contribution to the city; “This building is an important surviving example of early C20 industrial architecture by local architects Batchelor & Hicks. Frederick Hicks is a respected architect, responsible for a number of early public housing projects as well as public buildings in Dublin, such as the Iveagh Markets, Rathmines Library and St Thomas’s Church of Ireland in Cathal Brugha Street. He became president of the RIAI in 1929.” (Susan Roundtree, RIAI accredited Grade I Conservation Architect - RPS submission, July 2017).

Heading 3: An exemplar of a building type, plan-form, style or styles of any period but also the harmonious interrelationship of differing styles within one structure

It is submitted by David Slattery Conservation Architects that “The building is an oddity. Comprising a concrete frame with a rather mundanely composed front façade with strange mansard roof applied to it could not be considered to adhere to a particular style.” (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

Heading 4: A structure which makes a positive contribution to its setting, such as a streetscape or a group of structures in an urban area, or the landscape in a rural area

David Slattery Conservation Architects argue that the “strange mansard composition” doesn’t respond to its context, and that it would be unlikely to receive a favourable view if proposed for planning permission now.

Heading 5: A structure with an interior that is well designed, rich in decoration, complex or spatially pleasing

David Slattery Conservation Architects submit that “In respect of no.5 the interiors have been altered to such a degree that the remaining unaltered structural frame is the only fabric of interest.” (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

Historical Significance

Three submissions make reference to the fact that William Beckett, Samuel Beckett’s grandfather, was engaged as contractor for the project to build 5 Dame Lane. His firm, J&W Beckett, was established in the early 1870s and became one of the leading contracting firms in Dublin.

“Mr W. Beckett, Percy Place, Dublin is engaged in erecting new premises and warehouses for Messrs. Hely & Co. Ltd., Dame Street, Dublin. The building is to be of ferro-concrete (Hennebique’s system). Messrs. Batchelor and Hicks, 86 Merrion Square are the architects. Messrs J.R. Thompson of Fairview, Clontarf are the sub-

contractors for the "ferro-concrete".' (The Irish Builder & Engineer, September 22, 1906)

David Slattery Conservation Architects contests any significance associated with this connection. "Whatever about direct associations, it is difficult to accept an extended part of Hely's with Samuel Beckett solely on the basis of his grandfather's construction company." (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

Cultural Significance

Four submissions cite the references to Hely's in James Joyce's Ulysses. Wisdom Hely's company Hely Ltd., originally based in 27-30 Dame Street, was a prominent Dublin printworks, and a stationery and toy shop. Hely's was the former workplace of Leopold Bloom, the fictional hero in Joyce's Ulysses (1922), and is referenced in the novel when Bloom encounters sandwich-board men advertising Hely's (Chapter 8 'The Lestrygonians' and Chapter 10 'Wandering Rocks'). Hely's is also mentioned in Chapter 11 'Sirens', when Bloom buys vellum paper from Wisdom Hely's.

It is submitted by Denis O'Kelly that "Joyce himself also had a real connection with Hely's business and particularly in Thomas Keller AKA Keohlar, who in 1902 was appointed to "the important position of secretary to Messrs. Hely's, Ltd." (Weekly Irish Times, 11 January 1902, p.7), the celebrated Dublin stationers and printers in Dame Street ... Thomas Goodwin Koehler, was a friend with whom Joyce corresponded until his death in 1941.' (Denis O'Kelly – RPS submission, July 2017).

David Slattery Conservation Architects challenge the significance of this association to Joyce's Ulysses, as 5 Dame Lane was an extension of the Hely's premises, and was not extant in 1904, when Joyce's novel was set. "The references in Ulysses are at odds with the date of construction of this particular extension to the building. The earlier buildings on Dame Court and indeed Dame Street ... were more likely to have been the subject of reference by Joyce whom had left Dublin by the time of the subject extension's completion." (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

Shane O'Toole's submission clarifies the connection, which is by association. "It was built in 1906 as an extension to Hely's Printworks, associated with Hely's Department store on Dame Street which features prominently in James Joyce's Ulysses (Leopold Bloom is described as a former employee of Hely's)." (Shane O'Toole, Architect, Adjunct Associate Professor, UCD School of Architecture Planning and Environmental Policy / Treasurer, Docomomo Ireland – RPS submission, July 2017).

Technical Significance

Five submissions make reference to the Hennebique construction method employed in 5 Dame Lane.

Shane O'Toole submits that "5 Dame Lane is considered to be the first building in Dublin to be constructed using the influential Hennebique Reinforced Concrete system, which played a significant role in the development of modern architecture throughout the developed world. This fact alone is sufficient to warrant the inclusion of this significant structure on the RPS." (Shane O'Toole, Architect, Adjunct Associate Professor, UCD School of Architecture Planning and Environmental Policy / Treasurer, Docomomo Ireland – RPS submission, July 2017).

The first Hennebique structure in Ireland was the linen factory for Thomas Somerset in Belfast, designed by WJW Roome and completed in 1905. 5 Dame Lane was reputedly the first example of Hennebique construction in Dublin, and this is an opinion held by both Sean Rothery and Ellen Rowley. Although the quotes mention Dame Street, where Hely's had

their headquarters, they are references to 5 Dame Lane, the extension to Hely's premises, which was designed by Batchelor and Hicks in 1906.

'Hely's building in Dame Street was noted by the Irish Builder as the first use in Dublin of the Hennebique system. The building was completed in 1906 and the architects were Batchelor and Hicks.' (Rothery, 1991).

'De Courcy has estimated that there were eighty-three Hennebique structures built in Ireland between 1905 and 1920. Aside from engineering or industrial projects, the system of interlocking posts, beams and lintels lent itself well to multi-storey urban civic architecture, and the first application of it in Dublin streets was at Hely's premises, Dame Street (Batchelor and Hicks, 1906).' (Ellen Rowley, *Architecture 1600-2000: Art & Architecture of Ireland Vol.IV*, RIA 2004, p.72).

This claim is contested by David Slattery Conservation Architects, who reference the Jameson Whiskey Store in Smithfield as the first example in Dublin; "The Hennebique system was being adopted throughout the country at the time and was an obvious choice for such a warehouse-factory structure for its constructional advantages, structural and fire resistant qualities. It was not the first such use of the system in the UK and Ireland (Swansea 1897) or even in Dublin (Jameson 1905). By 1911 there were 24,000 works executed in Hennebique's system including 1073 in the UK and Ireland." (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

However, Niamh Marnham's 2015 Heritage report refutes this, and dates the Jameson building to 1908:

'Coming two years before the Jameson bonded whiskey store in Smithfield (1908), it therefore seems to strongly suggest that Hely's extension to their printworks at No. 5 Dame Lane was indeed the first building to employ the Hennebique system in Dublin, and is also one of the earliest in the country.' (Marnham, Niamh, *Fumbally Exchange, No.5 Dame Lane – Heritage Statement*, 2015)

Group Significance (Context and Setting)

Under the heading 'Group significance', David Slattery Conservation Architects argue that the group setting does not add any significance to the property: "*The group of buildings on the site were not developed at the same time, and neither match nor complement one another.*"

Design Suitability and Use

5 Dame Lane is the home of Fumbally Exchange, a co-working community comprising over 60 small businesses and a pop-up shop / exhibition area to the street, which was formally opened by President Michael Higgins in 2014.

Six submissions make reference to the suitability of the structure to its current use, as a creative hub and its longevity and flexibility of use which is testament to the robust design. "When so many buildings are knocked and replaced the longevity of this building shows how good the design was and its flexibility to adapt to changing requirements which were many, from Hely's Printworks, to telecommunications to the current Fumbally Exchange." (Olivia Golden, *Architectural Technologist* - RPS submission, July 2017).

However, it is submitted by David Slattery Conservation Architects that "The works carried out in 1972 under the direction of Niall Scott Architect completely altered the building to address a new use, layout and new fenestration to Dame Lane ... The present structure does not represent what was completed in 1908." (David Slattery Conservation Architects – RPS submission, August 2017).

Response to Submissions/Objections

The response to the seven written submissions in support of the addition and those of the one written objection to the proposed addition of the structure to the Record of Protected Structures, will be addressed according to the summarised issues/grounds of objection already outlined above, as follows:

- Architectural Significance; including detail and design.
- Historical Significance.
- Cultural Significance
- Technical Significance
- Group Significance (Context and Setting)
- Design Suitability and Use

Architectural Significance (including detail and design)

The following is a consideration of the architectural qualities of 5 Dame Lane, and the various submissions under the suggested 5 headings as provided in the Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities (DAHG, now the Department of Culture, Heritage and the Gaeltacht, (2011)):

The Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines clarify that the characteristics of architectural interest “may be attributed to a structure or part of a structure with such qualities as the following ...”, and offer suggested headings under which the architectural significance can be analysed. Not all the suggested headings are relevant to each proposed protected structure.

Heading 1: A generally agreed exemplar of good quality architectural design

Response: 5 Dame Lane presents a neo-classical façade to the street, the reserved architectural language disguising its use of a pioneering reinforced concrete structural system within. This approach was typical of the period, and was widely evident in the reconstruction of O’Connell Street (formerly Sackville Street) following the widespread destruction of 1916 and Civil War combat. Though not constructed in brick, like the neighbouring buildings, 5 Dame Lane responds to the scale and rhythm of the adjacent elevations.

There were considerable external and internal modifications to the building by Scott Tallon Walker in 1972. The elevation to Dame Street retains its proportions and scale, and contributes to the architectural context of the streetscape, but not to the extent that it requires a specific entry on the RPS

Heading 2: The work of a known and distinguished architect, engineer, designer or craftsman

Response: Batchelor & Hicks were a respected Dublin-based architectural firm, a partnership between George Frederick Hicks and Frederick Batchelor, established in 1905. They were responsible for an impressive body of work with prominent public buildings such as the Iveagh Markets, Rathmines Library, St Thomas’s Church on Cathal Brugha Street, Weir’s on Grafton Street, AIB on O’Connell Street and the Royal Irish Automobile Club on Dawson Street, in addition to several private houses. They were also noted for their industrial design work (of which 5 Dame Lane is an example), and went on to employ the Hennebique system in several later projects.

‘The addition of grain silos in the first half of the century embodied the emergence of proto-modern structures using the Hennebique system of reinforced concrete, notably the finely detailed twelve-storey grain silo by Batchelor and Hicks (1915-20) ...’ (Livia Hurley, Architecture 1600-2000: Art & Architecture of Ireland Vol.IV, 2004, p.251).

In addition to this, 5 Dame Lane was built by J&W Beckett, one of the leading construction companies in Dublin at the time.

Heading 3: An exemplar of a building type, plan-form, style or styles of any period but also the harmonious interrelationship of differing styles within one structure

Response: No. 5 Dame Lane is considered to be a rare surviving example of an urban industrial warehouse, a typology that is no longer commonplace in Dublin. The building has been altered several times since its construction to respond to the changing requirements of each subsequent use. This flexibility of use, and facility to adapt, is a positive design attribute. The combination of differing styles within the structure adds a rich layered complexity to the composition of the building, and the proposed addition to the RPS may halt this evaluation.

Heading 4: A structure which makes a positive contribution to its setting, such as a streetscape or a group of structures in an urban area, or the landscape in a rural area

Response: Despite alterations since its original composition, the elevation to Dame Lane is aesthetically pleasing, responds to the scale of the adjacent buildings, and contributes to the historical layering of the surrounding streetscape, as with many other buildings which form part of the streetscape, but are not specifically on the RPS.

Heading 5: A structure with an interior that is well designed, rich in decoration, complex or spatially pleasing

Response: 5 Dame Lane is a rare surviving example of an industrial warehouse, and its interior spaces have been adapted over the years for a variety of uses. The exposed Hennebique reinforced concrete structure enhances the quality of the interior and allows for spacious and flexible workspaces. The exposed King post truss roof structure to the third floor is also of interest, and contributes to the spatial qualities of the building.

Historical Significance

Response: William Beckett, Samuel Beckett's grandfather, was engaged as contractor for the project to build 5 Dame Lane. His firm, J&W Beckett, was established in the early 1870s and became one of the leading contracting firms in Dublin.

Cultural Significance

Response: Although the building itself was not constructed in 1904 when the novel was set, 5 Dame Lane, formerly part of Hely's, has become a part of the 'Bloom Trail', celebrating Bloom's association with Hely's Ltd.

Under the heading 'Cultural significance', the Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities (2011) make reference to '*Other structures that illustrate the development of society such as early schoolhouses, library buildings, swimming baths or printworks.*'

5 Dame Lane was originally a printworks, and part of the wider Hely's complex in the area. It is representative of a period in Dublin history when industry was thriving, and significant businesses such as Hely's were expanding. The variety of uses that the building has accommodated since its inception map the changing social and work practice circumstances in the area.

Technical Significance

Response: The numbers and construction dates referred to in David Slattery Conservation Architects' report (above in the Submissions/Objections section, under the Technical Significance heading) are taken from Patricia Cusack's paper '*Agents of Change: Hennebique, Mouchel and Ferro-concrete in Britain, 1897-1908*' (Construction History, Vol.3,

1987), which also includes a map illustrating the geographical distribution of Hennebique framed buildings in Britain and Ireland from 1897-1908.

Although 1073 Hennebique structures were recorded by 1911 in UK and Ireland, only 13 are recorded in Ireland in 1908; and of these, only 2 are in Leinster (Patricia Cusack, 1987). This demonstrates that Hely's Printworks (1906) was a very early example of the use of the Hennebique system in Ireland.

Group Significance (Context and Setting)

Response: Though it was conceived as an extension, 5 Dame Lane was designed by Batchelor & Hicks as a building in its own right, which has its own character but responds to the scale and proportions of its neighbouring properties.

Design Suitability and Use

Response: 5 Fumbally Lane has evolved to suit changing building requirements and facilitate new uses, and this is critical to promote the continuous use of a historic building, and ensure its longevity. Despite the various alterations the building retains the character of the original warehouse in its primary spaces.

The interior of 5 Dame Lane lends itself to continued use, through its ability to adapt to diverse uses while retaining the character of an industrial warehouse. As a workspace, it is greatly enjoyed by its occupants. Designation as a PS does not necessarily add to these attributes.

Concluding Response: 5 Dame Lane was designed by Batchelor & Hicks, a respected Dublin firm of architects who are responsible for several prominent public buildings in the city. It was built by J&W Beckett, one of the leading construction companies in Dublin at the time.

5 Dame Lane is considered to be of interest for its Hennebique reinforced concrete structure. It is certainly a very early example of the Hennebique system in Ireland, though not the first. However, it is generally considered to be the first building in Dublin where the Hennebique system was employed in construction. This is an opinion held by architectural historians Christine Casey, Seán Rothery and Ellen Rowley.

5 Dame Lane is a rare surviving example of an urban industrial warehouse from the early 20th Century, a typology that is no longer commonplace in Dublin, and is considered of special interest on the grounds outlined in the assessment and responses above and, therefore, worthy of protection by means of its addition to the Record of Protected Structures (RPS).

The building has been altered several times since its construction to respond to the changing requirements of each subsequent use. This flexibility of use, and facility to adapt, is a positive design attribute and is critical to promote the continuous use of a historic building, and ensure its longevity.

Despite the various alterations the building retains the character of the original warehouse in its primary spaces.

Having regard to all of the above, including the contested expert opinions in relation to the various special interest categories, it is considered that Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Court, Dublin 2 has some technical interest and architectural significance, and also of some, more limited, historical and cultural interest. As such, it is recommended on balance not to add the building to the Record of Protected Structures.

Meeting of the Area Committee

The proposed addition of Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Lane, Dublin 2, was originally brought forward to the South East Area Committee on the 8th of May 2017 where it was agreed by the elected members to initiate the procedure to add it to the RPS.

Recommendation

In accordance with Section 55 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, it is recommended that **Fumbally Exchange, 5 Dame Lane, Dublin 2**, not be added to the Record of Protected Structures in the Dublin City Development Plan 2011-2017. The making of an addition to the Record of Protected Structures is a reserved function of the City Council.

Richard Shakespeare
Assistant Chief Executive

Dated: 20th September 2017